



Item 4a

Date: September 20, 2006

To: Cultural Heritage Commission

From: Cultural Heritage Commission Staff

Subject: Certificate of Appropriateness for Addition—3631 Olive Avenue
(California Heights Historic District)

PLANNING CASE [Project No. 455904]: Certificate of Appropriateness request by Summer Love Hansen to construct an 862 square foot addition onto the existing garage located at 3631 Olive Avenue within the California Heights Historic District.

BACKGROUND:

The subject parcel is approximately 7,120 square feet in area and contains a one-story, single-family dwelling with 1,422 square feet of space and a detached garage. The style of the existing residence and garage, both built in 1927, is Spanish Eclectic. The house has undergone some modifications over the years, including the replacement of some windows with non-original louver type, the resurfacing of the exterior walls with a heavy textured stucco material, and the addition of a bathroom and closet (150 square feet) to the rear elevation. The garage has also been resurfaced with the heavy textured stucco material. Nonetheless, the property has been identified as a contributor to the California Heights Historic District. It retains sufficient integrity to continue to reflect the overall historic character of the neighborhood.

This project was before the Commission at the September 2005 Cultural Heritage Commission meeting. At that time, the project included a rear staircase leading from the deck of the second-story addition. It also had significant zoning issues regarding setbacks and door placement. The Commission laid the item over so that the applicant could address the outstanding issues accordingly. Since that time, the applicant has revised the plans to reflect the removal of the back staircase and removal of the arched wing wall above the front of the garage. They have also addressed the zoning issues and have changed some window and door treatments to be more compatible with the style and period of the house.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The applicant is proposing to add in total approximately 862 square feet of space to the existing garage with an interior staircase connecting the second floor addition to the rear of the one-story dwelling. A new brick walk and patio would also be constructed within the backyard. Under the proposed project, a shop/laundry room consisting of 192 square feet of space would be added onto the back of the garage structure (west elevation). A 503 square

foot master bedroom suite with outdoor deck would be erected above the garage. This new second story addition would be capped with a flat roof with parapet and tile coping. The deck at the rear of the addition would be sheltered by an open wood trellis and semi enclosed by a wrap-around stucco and wood guard wall of approximately 56 inches. An enclosed staircase that spans over a walkway between the garage and dwelling would ultimately connect the two structures together. Additionally, the existing horizontal wood plank garage door would be replaced with a horizontally laid roll-up door punctuated by small arched shape windows. A wood corbel table would run above the garage door opening under the slightly projecting second floor addition.

The new addition incorporates an architectural style similar to that of the existing house. The design, form, and materials of the new addition appear compatible with that of the existing residence and garage. As stated, the exterior walls of the new addition would be sheathed in stucco that matches what is currently on the two existing structures in terms of materials, texture, and appearance. The type, size, and placement of the fenestration proposed for the addition appear acceptable since they are similar to that on the main structure (double hung or arched shape fixed). Window frames for the new work call for being vinyl and are illustrated on the plans as being slightly recessed within their openings. Exterior entry doors would be multi-pane wood-frame French style.

ANALYSIS:

Compliance with section 2.63.070 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings* (the Standards), and the California Heights Historic Landmark District designation ordinance (Ordinance No. C-6704 and 7702): Staff has reviewed the proposed project in accordance with Chapter 2.63.070 of the Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission ordinance), the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, and the California Heights Historic Landmark District ordinance. Staff believes that the project meets the requirements of the Cultural Heritage Commission ordinance, and the intent of the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards* and the California Heights Historic Landmark District ordinance. Staff has also reviewed the plans for consistency with the City's zoning codes and found no outstanding zoning issues.

The general standards and guidelines of the California Heights Historic Landmark District ordinance emphasizes the importance of constructing new structures within the district that are compatible with the existing historic neighborhood in all aspects including site design, massing, roof forms, fenestration, and materials. For new construction within the historic district, including additions, the style of architecture, massing, and use of materials should not be uncharacteristically different from the existing styles of the district.

The style, details, and materials of the proposed work is similar to that on the existing house and garage in terms of visual appearance. The design of the addition complements the architectural style of the house, which is Spanish Eclectic. Fenestration calls for the use of vinyl windows throughout the addition. Staff believes the use of vinyl windows in new construction is acceptable if such frames are dimensional, recessed within the exterior walls,

and sized correctly to match the proportions of the window rails, casings, and sills on the residence historically. The majority of the work proposed will affect the garage structure leaving the original massing, size, and scale and proportion of the main house intact. Any visual impact to either the house or garage, as seen from the public right-of-way, is minimal since the addition is located at the far end of the driveway towards the back of the lot. Additionally, because of its shifted placement on the garage, the basic footprint of the garage structure, as seen from the street, remains somewhat evident.

With the conditions attached, the project meets the requirements of Section 2.63.070(C) of the Long Beach Municipal Code, the Standards, and the California Heights Historic Landmark District designation ordinance.

FACTS FOR FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.070(C) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the concerned property or of the landmark district in which it is located, is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.

The work called for on the submitted plans will be conducted primarily on the garage, which is considered a secondary structure. The rear elevation of the house (considered a secondary elevation, and not visible from the public right-of-way) will be slightly modified by the work; however, this elevation has already been altered by the construction of a small room addition that was built in 1992. Nonetheless, with the recommended conditions stipulated in the staff report the character defining features of the property that make it a contributor to the California Heights Historic District will be retained.

2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Department or the Planning and Building Department.

The existing property is not considered dangerous or unsafe. Therefore, this finding is not relevant for this particular property.

3. The proposed change is consistent with or not incompatible with the architectural period of the building.

The proposed work will be executed in the Spanish Eclectic style that includes the use of stucco material, double hung windows, flat roof with parapet and red tile coping, as well as wood French doors. As conditioned in the staff report the design, scale, mass, and proportions of the work noted on the submitted plans is compatible with the architectural period of the building.

4. The proposed change is compatible in architectural style with existing adjacent contributing structures in a historic landmark district.

The incorporation of Spanish Eclectic design elements and details into the new addition as conditioned acknowledges and complements the architectural style and period of the surrounding contributing structures in the historic district.

5. The scale, massing, proportions, materials, colors, textures, fenestration, decorative features and details proposed are consistent with the period and/or are compatible with adjacent structures.

With the recommended conditions the second story addition will use compatible materials and architectural detailing as the existing Spanish Eclectic style dwelling. The use of textured stucco, red clay tiles, and dimensional vinyl windows of similar type and visual appearance will be used on the addition. The off set of the second story addition on the existing garage and its size (503 square feet) does not visually conflict with the compatibility of the property and the adjacent structures.

6. The proposed change is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings by the U.S. Department of the Interior.

The work proposed, as conditioned, is consistent with the recommendations provided in the Standards. The scope of work has minimal affects on the dwelling, which is the primary attribute of the property. The addition does raise the roof level of the existing garage though its width and original garage door opening remain unchanged. Because the work is setback from the public right-of-way its overall visual impact to the property is considered minimal. The addition, as conditioned, would not adversely change or radically alter those character-defining features of the extant residence that identifies it as a contributing property to the California Heights Historic District.

ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT:

For environmental purposes, projects that are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards are categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15331 of the CEQA Guidelines (Class 31 exemption).

RECOMMENDATION:

Based on the above findings and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards staff recommends approval of the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the proposed work illustrated on the plans submitted herein, with the attached conditions incorporated.

EXHIBITS:

1. Certificate of Appropriateness Application
2. Project Plans
3. Location/District Map
4. Applicant Photos
5. Aerial Photos

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Project Number: 455904
CHC Meeting Date: September 20, 2006
Address: 3631 Olive Avenue
Historic District/LANDMARK: California Heights Historic District

General Conditions

1. This approval is for activities shown on plans received by the Planning and Building Department – Office of Historic Preservation on September 11, 2006. These plans are on file in this office, except as amended herein.
2. The project must be completed per the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission, including all conditions listed herein. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission or the Cultural Heritage Commission staff before implementing. Upon completion of the project, a Cultural Heritage Commission staff inspection must be requested by the Applicant to ensure that the approved plans have been executed according to approved plans and that all conditions have been implemented before OCCUPANCY hold can be released.
3. There is a ten calendar-day appeal period that will lapse at 4:30 p.m., 10 calendar days after the action by the Cultural Heritage Commission is made. Appeal of the Commission's action will not be accepted after this time. A separate fee will apply to appeal an action made by the Cultural Heritage Commission.
4. This Certificate of Appropriateness shall be in full force and effect from and after the date of the rendering of the decision by the Cultural Heritage Commission. Pursuant to the Cultural Heritage Commission Ordinance Section 2.63.070(J), this approval shall expire within one year if the authorized work has not commenced. Should the applicant be unable to comply with this restriction, an extension may be granted pursuant to Section 2.63.070(J) for an additional 12 months maximum. The applicant must request such an extension prior to expiration of this Certificate of Appropriateness. After that time, the applicant will be required to return to the Cultural Heritage Commission for approval. In addition, this Certificate of Appropriateness shall expire if the authorized work is suspended for a 180-day period after being commenced.
5. All required Planning and Building permit approvals shall be obtained. Separate plan check and permit fees will apply.

Specific Conditions of Approval

Prior to the issuance of building permits plans shall be revised to indicate the following subject to Cultural Heritage Commission staff approval:

1. All window frames within the new addition will be dimensional vinyl recessed within the exterior walls of the structure, and sized correctly to match the proportions of the window rails, casings, and sills on the main residence. They will also be painted a compatible color to match those frames on the existing residence.